DEVELOPMENT OF THE DETERRENT AND DEFENSE CAPACITY OF NATO IN EASTERN EUROPE: Approach to readiness and interoperability

Dr. Velizar Shalamanov
Bulgarian Academy of Sciences
&
Atlantic Council of Bulgaria

(Member of the NCOIC AC / Institutional Change Management Consultative council (UNWE))
After 19 years in military, followed by an academic career in the Academy of Sciences Dr. Shalamanov has several tours of public service: Deputy Minister of Defense (1998-2001), Minister of Defense (2014) and Director Demand Management in the NATO’s IT and Cyber Agency (2009-2017). Currently he is focusing on consolidation of the academic cyber capacity in Bulgaria and EU (under H2020 project). In parallel is his engagement in the NGOs and politics for better positions of Bulgaria in NATO and European defense, development of the information society and improvement of research governance.

Key points:
1. Development of NATO deterence and defense posture from RAP (Wales, 2014) through e/tFP and NATO-EU relations (Warsaw, 2016) and Readiness Initiative (Brussels, 2018) together with the Interoperability Initiative / Trust Funds / Cyber Partnership (Wales, 2014) and combined with the boosting of the European defense / European Intervention Forces initiative is shaping the environment for the further development of the cooperation in the Eastern Flank of NATO under B9 (Bucharest, 2015) through development of credible force structure of multinational formations.
2. Despite longterm SEE defense cooperation under SEDM/A5 the modalities of B9+ to address challenges between Adriatic - Black - Baltic Seas could be real accelerator in this environment under NATO/EU coordination
3. Practical focus on real projects in the area of Air surveillance (radars), federated mission networking, FFT, COP to form Readiness and Interoperability program (RIP) for B9+ in NATO/EU framework could bring the cooperation in defense to the next level.
“Tonight I hope the people of Serbia can hear our voices when we say: If you choose as Bulgaria has chosen, you will regain the rightful place in Europe that [Yugoslavian President Slobodan] Milosevic has stolen from you, and America will support you too,” Clinton said.
1. NATO developments on the **Eastern Flank** from Wales to Brussels Summits and ahead

2. Unfinished Business of the **Washington Summit 1999** and **Bucharest Summit of 2008**

3. Deterrence by **Denial** vs Deterrence by Punishment

4. **B9+ cooperation**: Baltic-Back-Adriatic Seas and N1S

5. **NORDEFCO / V4-BDC** model in **South Eastern Europe**

6. Program for **Readiness and Interoperability** in Eastern Europe under NATO/EU framework (based on N1S)

7. **Trust Fund** opportunities to engage partners in WB and Black Sea Region
Policy / scoping papers of the Atlantic Council of Bulgaria conference 28.9.2018

• Deterrence and defense posture in Eastern Europe
• Program for readiness and interoperability
• Coping with the hybrid challenges
• Improving understanding of NATO in Bulgaria under “We are NATO” campaign
Future Security Strategic Context for the Black Sea

Regional "frozen" conflicts and unresolved territorial claims
Future Security Strategic Context for the Black Sea region

Russian military dominance

Western Military District
Manpower 100,000
Main battle tanks – 2100
Armored vehicles – 2600
Artillery Systems - 800
MLRS – 200
Rocket Systems – 70
Combat Aircrafts – 400
Combat Helicopters - 330

Southern Military District
Manpower 110,000
Main battle tanks – 450
Armored vehicles – 2000
Artillery Systems - 650
MLRS – 180
Rocket Systems – 30
Combat Aircrafts – 400
Combat Helicopters - 200

Occupation Contingent
Manpower 28,000
Main battle tanks – 40
Armored vehicles – 583
Artillery Systems - 106
MLRS – 55
Rocket Systems – 16
Combat Aircrafts – 113
Combat Helicopters – 55
Combat Ships – 41
Submarines - 5

Manpower 31,300
Main battle tanks – 90
Armored vehicles – 160
Artillery Systems - 311
Combat Aircrafts – 22
Combat Helicopters – 30
Combat Ships – 22

Manpower 5,150
Armored vehicles – 153
Artillery Systems - 221
Combat Aircrafts – 3
Combat Helicopters – 6

Manpower 355,200
Main battle tanks – 2485
Armored vehicles – 5593
Artillery Systems - 7795
Combat Aircrafts – 344
Combat Helicopters – 175
Combat Ships – 259
Submarines - 12

Manpower 69,300
Main battle tanks – 460
Armored vehicles – 1391
Artillery Systems - 927
Combat Aircrafts – 55
Combat Helicopters – 30
Combat Ships – 40

Manpower 204,000
Main battle tanks – 863
Armored vehicles – 2048
Artillery Systems - 1737
MLRS – 118
Rocket Systems – 90
Combat Aircrafts – 49
Combat Helicopters – 30
Combat Ships – 40
ADAPTED NATO COMMAND STRUCTURE

- New JFC for the Atlantic – **Norfolk**, USA;
- New Joint Support and Enabling Command (JSEC) – **Ulm**, Germany;
  - Standing Joint Logistics Support Group Headquarters (SJLSG HQ) – **Ulm**, Germany;
  - JLSG – **Brunssum** (NL) and **Naples** (IT);
GRADUATED READINESS FORCES **LAND** – enforced by Forward Presence, Atlantic Resolve / EDI and EU BG

NATO Adaptation:

Increased requirements from NFS and reliance on NFS for additional and follow on Joint C2

- NFIU
- eFP rotational BG
- tFP element

ARRC
Innsworth, GBR

RRC-FR
Lille, FRA

EUROCORPS
Strasbourg, FRA

NRDC-SP
Valencia, ESP

NRDC-IT
Milan, ITA

1 GE/NL CORPS
Münster, DEU

MNC NE
Szczecin, POL

HQ MND SE
Bucharest, ROU

NRDC-TU
Istanbul, TUR

GRADUATED READINESS FORCES **LAND** – enforced by Forward Presence, Atlantic Resolve / EDI and EU BG

NATO Adaptation:

Increased requirements from NFS and reliance on NFS for additional and follow on Joint C2

- NFIU
- eFP rotational BG
- tFP element

ARRC
Innsworth, GBR

RRC-FR
Lille, FRA

EUROCORPS
Strasbourg, FRA

NRDC-SP
Valencia, ESP

NRDC-IT
Milan, ITA

1 GE/NL CORPS
Münster, DEU

MNC NE
Szczecin, POL

HQ MND SE
Bucharest, ROU

NRDC-TU
Istanbul, TUR
Balkans (10 countries) + Black Sea-Caucasus (4 more to the East)

1. UKR
2. GEO
3. ARM
4. AZR
Dimensions of multinationality on the NRDC level

Affiliated Forces

- ITA
- GRC
- ESP ("CANARIAS")
- ROU
- GRC
- PONTOS
- BGR
- GRC

Dedicated Combat Support Forces

- SPT BN
- NRDC-GR

Dedicated Combat Service Support Forces

- CSS
- MP
- ROLE 2LM
- ROLE 2E
- AIR MEDEVAC

Legend:

- Integral
- Organic
- Dedicated
- Affiliated

Dimensions of multinationality on the NRDC level
EU Battle Groups

EU military instrument for rapid response.
1500 personnel strong
For stand-alone operations or for the initial phase of larger operations.
Based on a combined-arms, battalion-sized force.
Sustainable for 30 days,
Extendable to 120 days
Deployed and sustained at strategic distances of 6,000 km or more from the EU territory
Multinationality on EU side

BULGARIAN PARTICIPATION in HELBROC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HELLAS</td>
<td>1063</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BULGARIA</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ROMANIA</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CYPRUS</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UKRAINE</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>1421</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Multinationality on EU side

BULGARIAN PARTICIPATION in HELBROC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSS</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NSE</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>186</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Reality of EU defense capabilities
*(all below art. 5 threshold and outside EU)*

- **Rescue/Evacuation (RE)**
- **Support to Humanitarian Assistance (SHA)**
- **Stabilization and Support to Capacity Building (SSCB)**
- **Conflict Prevention (CP)**
- **Peace Enforcement (PE)**

- **Civilian and military Rapid Response, including military rapid response operations inter alia using the EU Battlegroups as a whole or within a mission-tailored Force Package**
- **Civilian Capacity Building and Security Sector Reform**
- **Joint Stabilization operations, including air and special operations**
- **Air security operations including close air support and air surveillance**
- **Maritime security or surveillance operations, including longer term in the vicinity of Europe**
- **Joint Crisis Management operations in situations of high security risk in the regions surrounding the EU**
EU-NATO cooperation

- Information sharing
- Coordinated planning
- Concrete cooperation

in the areas of:

Hybrid Threats
Operational cooperation
Cyber Security
Capacity building

Defence capabilities
Industry and research
Exercises
Development of NATO 1st Solution
from AMN to Forward Presence
Scope of N1S Implementation
NCIA supported Program for Readiness and Interoperability
Implementation model for N1S to support Program for Readiness and Interoperability

Find out more on https://dnbl.ncla.nato.int
Program „Readiness and Interoperability“
(Cyber Resilience / HW Resilience)

1. Focus on **C4ISR with N1S** as a model (flagship implementation for 1 GNC and LANDCOM leadership)
2. **Start with B9** (following the success with MND CE and MND SE), supporting Forward Presence (eFP/tFP)
3. Extend to B9+ (**WB, Black Sea**) – first NATO members and later partners in NATO Interoperability Initiative
4. Support to **multinational formations** as a priority one, followed by **exercises**
5. Use NATO, but EU **framework** as much as possible
6. Add **E&T / R&D** component and active **StratCom** component, involving the NGO
7. Include civil-mil cooperation for **mobility and crisis management** with special focus on **Cyber Defense / meeting Hybrid Warfare challenges**
Basic Environment for Simulation & Training: „Resilience“

- Project & Service Management
- Customer / Partners Relations Management
- Requirements & Operations
- BEST – Resilience Change Management
- Policy
- Scenario Development
- Analysis & Presentations
- Technology and Innovation
- Research & Education
- Simulation
- Real Systems Interfaces
Conclusions

1. Develop FFT papers on key initiatives country by country with NGO involved or even in the lead.
2. Consult regionally and with NATO / EU (engage US think-thanks) to transform FFT papers in Policy papers with focus on MN Force Structure.
3. Seek political decisions on highest level.
4. Develop project oriented scoping papers to set up a business cases for a portfolio of projects.
5. Seek NATO / EU frameworks to support the cases.
6. Commit nationally and regionally, including financially to stimulate Trust Fund policy implemented.
7. Implement with industry and academia for sustainability and transformational benefits for the countries in the region.